



CONTEMPORARY GEOGRAPHIES
OF LEISURE, TOURISM AND MOBILITY

SM
DEVELOPMENT MICK SMITH AND
ROSALEEN DUFFY THE ETHICS OF
TOURISM DEVELOPMENT MICK SMIT
AND ROSALEEN DUFFY THE ETHICS
OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT MICK
SMITH AND ROSALEEN DUFFY THE
ETHICS OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT
MICK SMITH AND ROSALEEN DUFFY
THE ETHICS OF TOURISM
DEVELOPMENT MICK SMITH AND
ROSALEEN DUFFY THE ETHICS OF
TOURISM DEVELOPMENT MICK SMIT
AND ROSALEEN DUFFY THE ETHICS
OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT MICK
SMITH AND ROSALEEN DUFFY THE
ETHICS OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT
MICK SMITH AND ROSALEEN DUFFY
THE ETHICS OF TOURISM

The Ethics of Tourism Development

Most tourists travel to ‘get away from it all’, to relax in new surroundings, untroubled by the constrictions and irritations that characterize everyday modern life. Ironically, in doing so they contribute to the growth of what is generally regarded as the world’s largest industry, one that has massive impacts on people’s lives, cultures and environment. Given these impacts it is surprising that the ethical issues that surround tourism development have received little academic attention.

The Ethics of Tourism Development draws upon a variety of ethical traditions to develop an original perspective on the relations between ethical, economic and aesthetic values in the context of modern tourism. It considers the ethical/political issues arising in many areas of tourism development including the reciprocity (or lack of it) in ‘host’–‘guest’ relations, the (un)fair distribution of benefits and revenues, and the moral implications of issues like sex-tourism, ‘staged authenticity’ and travel to countries with oppressive regimes. The book concludes with a detailed investigation of the potential and pitfalls of eco-tourism, sustainable tourism and ‘community-based tourism’ as examples of what is sometimes termed ‘ethical tourism’.

The authors explain ethical issues without the use of excessive jargon and through the extensive use of contemporary case studies in tourism development from Europe, Zimbabwe and Belize among others. In this way the book seeks to account for the manner in which tourism, often all too uncritically, exports the values and presuppositions associated with its own cultural origins enabling readers to compare and contrast a variety of frameworks for thinking through these complex and often contentious issues.

Mick Smith is Reader in Sociology at the University of Abertay Dundee. **Rosaleen Duffy** is a lecturer in Politics and International Relations at Lancaster University.

Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility

Series editor: Michael Hall is Professor at the Department of Tourism, University of Otago, New Zealand.

The aim of this series is to explore and communicate the intersections and relationships between leisure, tourism and human mobility within the social sciences.

It will incorporate both traditional and new perspectives on leisure and tourism from contemporary geography, e.g. notions of identity, representation and culture, while also providing for perspectives from cognate areas such as anthropology, cultural studies, gastronomy and food studies, marketing, policy studies and political economy, regional and urban planning, and sociology, within the development of an integrated field of leisure and tourism studies.

Also, increasingly, tourism and leisure are regarded as steps in a continuum of human mobility. Inclusion of mobility in the series offers the prospect to examine the relationship between tourism and migration, the sojourner, educational travel, and second home and retirement travel phenomena.

The series comprises two strands:

Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility aims to address the needs of students and academics, and the titles will be published in hardback and paperback. Titles include:

The Moralisation of Tourism

Sun, sand . . . and saving the world?

Jim Butcher

The Ethics of Tourism Development

Mick Smith and Rosaleen Duffy

Tourism in the Caribbean (forthcoming)

Trends, development and prospects

Edited by David Timothy Duval

Qualitative Research in Tourism (forthcoming)

Edited by Jenny Phillimore and Lisa Goodson

Routledge Studies in Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility is a forum for innovative new research intended for research students and academics, and the titles will be available in hardback only. Titles include:

1 Living with Tourism

Negotiating identities in a Turkish village

Hazel Tucker

The Ethics of Tourism Development

Mick Smith and Rosaleen Duffy

First published 2003
by Routledge
11 New Fetter Lane, London EC4P 4EE
Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada
by Routledge
29 West 35th Street, New York, NY 10001

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor and Francis Group

© 2003 Mick Smith and Rosaleen Duffy

Typeset in Times by
Keystroke, Jacaranda Lodge, Wolverhampton
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Smith, Mick, 1961–

The ethics of tourism development / Mick Smith & Rosaleen Duffy.

p. cm. – (Contemporary geographies of leisure, tourism, and mobility)

Includes bibliographical references (p.).

1. Tourism–Social aspects. 2. Tourism–Moral and ethical aspects.

I. Duffy, Rosaleen. II. Title. III. Series: Routledge/contemporary geographies of leisure, tourism, and mobility.

G155.A1S565 2003

174'.991–dc21

2002155173

ISBN 0–415–26685–8 (hbk)

ISBN 0–415–26686–6 (pbk)

**To Alan and Eileen Smith, and
to Margaret and William Duffy**

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction	1
1 Ethical values	7
2 The virtues of travel and the virtuous traveller	32
3 The greatest happiness is to travel?	53
4 Rights and codes of practice	73
5 From social justice to an ethics of care	91
6 Authenticity and the ethics of tourism	114
7 Ethics and sustainable tourism	135
8 Conclusion	160
<i>Notes</i>	167
<i>Bibliography</i>	169
<i>Index</i>	190

Illustrations

Plates

2.1	The church of Santo Tomás in Chichecastanango, Guatemala, 1994	37
3.1	Tourists elephant watching in Minneriya National Park, Sri Lanka, 2001	58
3.2	Another view of tourists in Minneriya National Park	59
3.3	The new five-star Sheraton Hotel in the centre of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, 2002	63
3.4	Whale watching in Tadoussac, Canada, 2000	65
4.1	Dawn at the El Tatio Geyser, Chile, as the tourists disembark, 2000	78
6.1	Idyllic beachscape, Nosy Be, Madagascar, 2001	119
6.2	Sign urging local people to assist in developing the tourism industry, Belize City, 2000	121
7.1	Rubbish created by tourism in Placencia being burnt at the rear of the main village	136
7.2	Rafael Cal of the Toledo Ecotourism Association, and a TEA guesthouse in Medina Bank Village, Belize, 2000	141
7.3	Elephants at Hwange National Park, Zimbabwe, 1996	146
8.1	Independence Day in Cuzco, Peru, 2000	160

Figures

1.1	Spheres of values	10
1.2	Value inter-relations	14
1.3	Relationship between value fields in pre-modern society and in modern society	17
1.4	Moral subjectivism regards ethical values as one kind of personal preference	25
2.1	'Playing' with social roles and individual values	39
5.1	Two possible distributions of social goods	93
5.2	Rawls suggests that this kind of unequal distribution is acceptable because everyone benefits more than in a situation of absolute equality	97

Boxes

1.1	Moral scepticism and the ring of Gyges	20
1.2	Amoralism and moral subjectivism in tourism theory	24
4.1	Tourism development, outdoor pursuits and rights of access	82
4.2	Burma (Myanmar): tourism and human rights	86
5.1	Rawls's original position and real people: the case of the Sa	100
5.2	Tourism and an ethics of care: the ethics of tourism research	108

Acknowledgements

Mick would like to thank the many people who have helped develop and clarify the ideas in this book through discussion and debate. In particular he would like to thank his colleagues in the Unit for Social and Environmental Research (USER) and the division of Sociology at Abertay: Jason Annetts, Gianluigi Giorgioni, Linda Gray, Alex Howson, Alex Law, Wallace McNeish, Andy Panay, Anne Reuss, Peter Romilly and Hazel Work. Between them they have provided the intellectual climate and friendship that still makes academia worthwhile. Thanks also to Eleanor Lothian, with whom I've taught a course on Tourism and Development Ethics for the past four years. I'd also like to mention Phil Mason – sorry I forgot your birthday! Thanks to Sam, Furdie and Horace, and to Joyce Davidson for everything.

Rosaleen would like to thank the many people who were involved in this book. The research was funded by Lancaster University and the Economic and Social Research Council, while I was at Edinburgh University 1997–9 (grant number L320253245) and at Lancaster University 1999–2000 (grant number R000223013). Numerous individuals and organizations provided help and support during the research, not least the tourists who allowed their holidays to be interrupted with interviews. In Toledo District I would like to thank Gregory Ch'oc of the Kekchi Council of Belize, Chet Schmidt of the TEA, Pio Coc of the TMCC and Rafael Cal of the TEA/Medina Bank village. In Belize I was also very grateful for the hospitality shown by Mary Vasquez and Aline Harrison, and thanks to the Marine Research Centre at the University of Belize for providing me with office space and a place to talk over the research. In Zimbabwe I thank Jay Singh, Peter, Melissa and David Makwarimba, and Lauren for their hospitality. When I returned to the UK, my colleagues at Lancaster provided an excellent environment in which to conduct research and they supported me through writing it all up. I remain especially appreciative of the support from Feargal Cochrane while this manuscript was in the final stages of preparation. Finally, I thank Joyce Davidson for her patience over the course of this whole project.