

CONTEMPORARY GEOGRAPHIES OF LEISURE, TOURISM AND MOBILITY

JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM OUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM ONTOLOGIES, EPISTEMOLOGIES AND METHODOLOGIES EDITED BY JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON QUALITATIVE RESEARCH IN TOURISM JENNY PHILLMORE AND LISA GOODSON A

Also available as a printed book see title verso for ISBN details

Qualitative Research in Tourism

While qualitative approaches are beginning to be more commonly used and accepted in tourism, discussions of research methods have rarely moved beyond practical considerations. To date there has been limited attention given to the underlying philosophical and theoretical underpinnings that influence the research process. This book links the theory with research practice, to offer a more holistic account of how qualitative research can be used in tourism.

Qualitative Research in Tourism is the first book to focus solely upon this subject. It combines discussions of the philosophies underpinning qualitative research, with chapters written in a reflexive style that demonstrate the ways in which the techniques can be used. The book is based on a range of empirical tourism studies set in the context of theoretical discussion. It demonstrates the benefits of using a range of qualitative approaches to research tourism, and the text explores the ways in which a number of techniques, including participant observation, memory-work, biographical diaries and focus groups, have been adopted by researchers from a range of disciplinary backgrounds to undertake empirical research in tourism.

The book offers a range of case studies written by leading scholars from the United Kingdom, France, America, Australia, New Zealand and Indonesia. The book makes clear the ways in which these pieces of research have been informed by the authors' ontological, epistemological and methodological standpoint. *Qualitative Research in Tourism* will be indispensable to any final-year undergraduates, masters' and PhD students embarking on research in the field, and also academics with an interest in either tourism research or qualitative methodology.

Jenny Phillimore is a Lecturer and **Lisa Goodson** is a Research Fellow at the Centre for Urban and Regional Studies, The University of Birmingham.

Contemporary geographies of leisure, tourism and mobility

Series Editor: Michael Hall

Professor at the Department of Tourism, University of Otago, New Zealand

The aim of this series is to explore and communicate the intersections and relationships between leisure, tourism and human mobility within the social sciences.

It will incorporate both traditional and new perspectives on leisure and tourism from contemporary geography, e.g. notions of identity, representation and culture, while also providing for perspectives from cognate areas such as anthropology, cultural studies, gastronomy and food studies, marketing, policy studies and political economy, regional and urban planning, and sociology, within the development of an integrated field of leisure and tourism studies.

The series comprises two strands:

Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility aims to address the needs of students and academics, and the titles will be published in hardback and paperback. Titles include:

The Moralisation of Tourism

Sun, sand . . . and saving the world? *Jim Butcher*

The Ethics of Tourism Development

Mick Smith and Rosaleen Duffy

Tourism in the Caribbean

Trends, development and prospects Edited by David Timothy Duval

Oualitative Research in Tourism

Ontologies, epistemologies and methodologies Edited by Jenny Phillimore and Lisa Goodson

Routledge Studies in Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility is a forum for innovative new research intended for research students and academics, and the titles will be available in hardback only. Titles include:

1. Living with Tourism

Negotiating identities in a Turkish village *Hazel Tucker*

Qualitative Research in Tourism

Ontologies, epistemologies and methodologies

Edited by Jenny Phillimore and Lisa Goodson



First published 2004 by Routledge 11 New Fetter Lane, London EC4P 4EE

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada by Routledge

29 West 35th Street, New York, NY 10001

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group

This edition published in the Taylor & Francis e-Library, 2004.

© 2004 editorial matter and selection Jenny Phillimore and Lisa Goodson, individual chapters, the contributors

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Qualitative research in tourism: ontologies, epistemologies and

methodologies / edited by Jenny Phillimore and Lisa Goodson.

p. cm. — (Contemporary geographies of leisure, tourism and mobility)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Tourism—Research—Methodology. 2. Qualitative research—Methodology. I. Phillimore, Jenny. II. Goodson, Lisa, 1972- III. Series: Routledge/contemporary geographies of leisure, tourism, and mobility.

G155.A1O34 2004 910'.72—dc22

2003018374

ISBN 0-203-64298-8 Master e-book ISBN

ISBN 0-203-67608-4 (Adobe eReader Format) ISBN 0-415-28086-9 (hbk) ISBN 0-415-28087-7 (pbk)

Contents

	List of illustrations	viii
	Notes on contributors	ix
	Foreword	XV
	Acknowledgements	xvii
PA	RT I	
	y ontological, epistemological and methodological issues social science	1
1	Progress in qualitative research in tourism: epistemology, ontology and methodology	3
	JENNY PHILLIMORE AND LISA GOODSON	
2	The inquiry paradigm in qualitative tourism research	30
	LISA GOODSON AND JENNY PHILLIMORE	
3	Knowing about tourism: epistemological issues	46
4	A primer in ontological craft: the creative capture of people and places through qualitative research KEITH HOLLINSHEAD	63
5	Ontological craft in tourism studies: the productive mapping of identity and image in tourism settings KEITH HOLLINSHEAD	83
6	(Dis)embodied experience and power dynamics in tourism research	102

7	Standpoint research: multiple versions of reality in tourism theorising and research BARBARA HUMBERSTONE	119
8	Reflexivity and tourism research: situating myself and/with others MICHAEL HALL	137
9	Trustworthiness in qualitative tourism research ALAIN DECROP	156
10	New wine in old bottles: an adjustment of priorities in the anthropological study of tourism DENNISON NASH	170
11	From ontology, epistemology and methodology to the field JENNY PHILLIMORE AND LISA GOODSON	185
	RT II om research theory to practice	195
12	The research process as a journey: from positivist traditions into the realms of qualitative inquiry KAREN THOMAS	197
13	Let your data do the talking: researching the solo travel experiences of British and American women FIONA JORDAN AND HEATHER GIBSON	215
14	The life and work history methodology: a discussion of its potential use for tourism and hospitality research ADELE LADKIN	236
15	Memory-work JENNIE SMALL	255
16	Contributions of qualitative research to understanding the politics of community ecotourism	273

		Contents vii
17	Shared benefits: longitudinal research in eastern Indonesia STROMA COLE	292
18	Translators, trust and truth: cross-cultural issues in sustainable tourism research	311
	Index	324

Illustrations

Figu	res	
		50
3.1	The creation of tourist knowledge	50
8.1	The context of academic tourism knowledge, action and	1 11
10.1	culture	141
12.1	Response grids	204
12.2	Hierarchical structure of the thematic framework	207
Tabl	es	
1.1	Tourism and leisure journals included in the post-1996	
	review	7
1.2	Framework for the post-1996 review	8
1.3	Relationship between the post-1996 review framework and	
	Denzin and Lincoln's five moments of qualitative research	9
4.1	Strategies and methods in qualitative research: Holliday's	
	continuum from naturalistic to progressive outlooks	70
4.2	The building blocks of scientific inquiry: a comparison of	
	three lead structural worldviews (paradigms)	76
5.1	Common ontological issues in tourism studies	85–86
15.1	Memory-work: research design	261
17.1	Changing roles, activities and relationships over time	298
Boxe	es	
12.1	Advantages and limitations of the focus group method	201–202
13.1	Advantages and limitations of semi-structured in-depth	
	interviewing	222-223
15.1	Advantages and limitations of memory-work	259
16.1	Advantages and limitations of participant observation	278
17.1	Advantages and limitations of participant observation (2)	297
17.2	Using focus groups in non-Western settings	306

Contributors

Jill Belsky is Professor and Chair of the Sociology Department at the University of Montana. She received her PhD from Cornell University in 1991 in rural sociology. She teaches classes in environmental sociology, social theory, gender and global development. She has conducted research in Indonesia, the Philippines, Belize and the interior American West on the opportunities for, and constraints to, collaborative, community-based approaches in rural and environmental management, most recently focusing on rural ecotourism.

Stroma Cole studied social anthropology and environmental biology at Oxford Brookes University and continued her studies with a master's in social anthropology at the School of Oriental and African Studies, London University. Stroma has recently completed a PhD in the anthropology of tourism at the University of North London.

Following extensive travel of her own and on completion of her master's, Stroma started her own tour operating business in Indonesia. For seven years she led small groups all over the archipelago. After a period of consultancy for UNESCO and ADB she returned to the United Kingdom to take up her post in the Faculty of Leisure and Tourism at Buckinghamshire Chilterns University College, where she has been working for five years. Stroma's professional and research interests include tourism development in less developed countries, the anthropology of tourism, responsible tourism, and Web-based learning for tourism studies.

Alain Decrop is Assistant Professor at the University of Namur and Visiting Professor at the Catholic University of Louvain, Belgium. He holds masters' degrees in history and economics, and a PhD in business administration. His major research interests include consumer behaviour, qualitative interpretive methods, and tourism marketing. His works have been published in journals such as *Tourism Management*, the *Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing* and *Tourism Analysis*, as well as in many books.

Heather Gibson is Assistant Professor in the Department of Recreation, Parks and Tourism and an Associate Director of the Center for Tourism Research and Development at the University of Florida. She teaches and researches in the sociology of leisure, tourism and sport. Some of her research projects over the years include change and stability in tourist role preference over the adult life course, the leisure-travel patterns of older adults, and a cross-cultural study of solo women travellers with Fiona Jordan at Cheltenham and Gloucester College of Higher Education, UK. Her current projects include an investigation of the meaning of leisure in the lives of retirement-aged women, the serious leisure associated with being a University of Florida football fan, and the sport tourism implications associated with US college sport. She has published in the *Annals of Tourism Research*, *Leisure Studies*, *Society and Leisure* and the *Journal of Vacation Marketing* among others.

Lisa Goodson is Research Fellow at the University of Birmingham, Centre for Urban and Regional Studies. Her PhD focused on community participation and sustainable development in urban tourism. Lisa specialises in qualitative research and has extensive experience working with a range of community groups on issues concerning social exclusion, regeneration, sustainable development and training. She has worked on a range of projects funded by organisations such as the United Nations, the DETR, the ODPM and the LSC. She also co-directs the postgraduate qualitative research methods programme at the university and runs day seminars for public service personnel on qualitative research and community consultation, and through the development of an innovative Peer Research Programme she, together with Jenny Phillimore, trains socially excluded community groups to become co-researchers.

Michael Hall is Professor and Head of the Department of Tourism at the School of Business, University of Otago in New Zealand. He is also coeditor of *Current Issues in Tourism* and chair of the International Geographical Union Study Group on Tourism, Leisure and Social Change. He has published widely on areas relating to tourism, heritage and environmental history. His current research interests include tourism as a component of economic restructuring, particularly in rural areas; contemporary mobility, second homes, wine and food tourism, and lifestyle.

Keith Hollinshead is Professor of Public Culture at the University of Luton in England. He is also Visiting Professor in Cultural Tourism at The University of Western Sydney, Australia. Originally a 'marketing' specialist, he has become an eclectic theorist drawing insight from anthropology, political science, cultural studies, human communications, and continental philosophy amongst a wide mix of domains.

Over the years, Professor Hollinshead has worked on the editorial

board of eight international peer-review journals, and has served as Joint-Masthead Editor on three of them, namely Tourism Analysis, Tourism. Culture and Communication and Current Issues in Tourism. He also served as Vice President #2 for International Tourism for the International Sociological Association for 8 years, co-ordinating its pioneering Paradigmatologie in Finland in 1996, and its 'Worldscape 21' Colloquium in Belgium in 2001.

Barbara Humberstone is Professor of Sociology of Leisure at Buckinghamshire Chilterns University College. She teaches gender, difference and leisure, and outdoor education and adventure recreation. Her research interests include social and environmental equity/justice and leisure, (eco)feminist theories, cultural diversity and research methodologies. Barbara is a board member of the European Institute for Outdoor Adventure Education and Experiential Learning. She is a member of the editorial board of Leisure Studies, journal of the Leisure Studies Association.

She recently contributed to the development of a World Leisure Position Statement: Outdoor Leisure Education for the World Leisure Association in July 2001. She is a frequently invited keynote speaker to a number of national and international conferences, most recently Gender Transgressions and Contested Nature Nature and Identity (programme for Cultural Research by the Research Council of Norway), Alta, Norway, 6-9 September 2001, and was Visiting Professor to the Department of Outdoor Education and Nature Tourism, La Trobe University, Bendigo, Australia, in spring 2001.

Guy Jobbins is a coastal ecologist specialising in the governance of human-ecosystem interactions. Guy has worked in a variety of roles in the United Kingdom and across the Middle East, most recently as a Research Fellow at University College London developing decision support tools for ecosystem management.

Fiona Jordan is Senior Lecturer in Leisure and Tourism Management in the School of Sport and Leisure at Cheltenham and Gloucester College of Higher Education, UK. She graduated from Manchester Metropolitan University with a degree in Hotel and Catering Management, has a master's degree in Leisure and Tourism Studies and is currently studying part-time for her PhD. Fiona has a general research interest in the relationship between women and tourism, both as producers and consumers. She has previously published in the areas of women in leisure and tourism management, and the experiences of women as solo tourists. Her work with Heather Gibson focuses on cross-cultural comparisons of the experiences of women travelling solo and her work with Cara Aitchison focuses on discourses of power and knowledge in leisure and tourism pedagogy and research. She is

particularly interested in researching leisure, tourism and heritage as sites and processes of social, spatial and cultural inclusion and exclusion.

Adele Ladkin is Reader in Tourism at the International Centre for Tourism and Hospitality Research, School of Service Industries, Bournemouth University, UK. She is the Deputy Head of Research, and Head of MICE research unit within the School of Service Industries. Her research interests and publications are in the area of tourism education, career analysis and labour mobility in the tourism and hospitality industry, and the meetings, incentives, conventions and exhibitions industry. She is currently Assistant Editor in Chief for the *International Journal of Tourism Research*. She gained an MSc in Tourism Management and a PhD from the University of Surrey.

Dennison Nash is Emeritus Professor of Anthropology at the University of Connecticut, Storrs. He is the author of various writings, among which are *Anthropology of Tourism* (1996) and *A Community in Limbo* (1970); he also continues to teach a course in ethnographic fieldwork and is associated, as membership chairman, with Benmarl, the oldest surviving vineyard in the United States.

Jenny Phillimore completed her PhD, an ethnographic study of women's employment in rural tourism in the United Kingdom, in 1998, and since then has been Lecturer at the Centre for Urban and Regional Studies at the University of Birmingham. She co-directs the Post-Graduate Qualitative Research Programme at the university and works very closely with Lisa Goodson on a range of different initiatives. These include running seminars on qualitative research and inclusivity for public service professionals and undertaking a wide range of qualitative research projects largely concerned with involving excluded communities in regeneration initiatives and increasing the employability of hardto-reach groups. Their work has included the development of an innovative Peer Research Programme which trains excluded individuals to become co-researchers. Beneficiaries of this programme have included offenders, homeless young people, and asylum seekers and refugees. She is currently leading a number of substantial research projects looking at the experiences of asylum seekers and refugees in the United Kingdom, wherein she has called upon a wide range of qualitative as well as quantitative research methods.

Jennie Small is Lecturer in the School of Leisure, Sport and Tourism at the University of Technology, Sydney, Australia. Her main teaching and research interest is tourist behaviour. She is the author of various published papers on memory-work and co-editor of a collection of memory-work papers that emanated from the Memory-work Research Conference, which she organised in Sydney in 2000. She is completing

her doctoral studies investigating the positive and negative aspects of women's and girls' holiday experiences.

Margaret Byrne Swain is Director of the Center for Gender and Global Issues in the Women and Gender Studies Program at the University of California, Davis, and affiliated as an Adjunct Professor in Anthropology. Her dissertation research in the 1970s was on gender and tourism development issues among the San Blas Kuna of Panama. Continuing interest in minority indigenous peoples, missionaries and tourists informs her current work in south-west China and her forthcoming book on 'embodied cosmopolitanism'. She has edited several collections on gender in tourism (*Annals of Tourism Research* 22(2) 1995; with Janet Momsen, Cognizant Communication Corporation 2001), and authored numerous ethnographic and theoretical articles. Her work on gender and global environmental and population issues is both instructional and praxis-orientated, bridging academics and activism.

Karen Thomas is Senior Lecturer in Tourism Studies in the Department of Geography and Tourism, Canterbury Christ Church University College. She received her PhD from the University of Birmingham, which evaluates a tourist role scale technique as a foundation for the development of theory and practice of tourism marketing strategies. She has conducted consultancy research for both public- and private-sector organisations, most recently undertaking focus group research for Medway Council on the 'Optimum Branding of Medway and its Specific Attractions as a Total Visitor Destination: The Short Break Experience'. In her present post she specialises in lecturing in the areas of tourism marketing, tourism policy and development, and research methods, and is Programme Director for the MSc in Tourism and Environmental Management. Her key research interests are in destination marketing and branding, destination imagery, and tourism marketing communication strategies.

John Tribe is Head of Research in the Faculty of Leisure and Tourism at Buckinghamshire Chilterns University College. John graduated in economics from the University of London, and returned there to study for his MA and PhD. His MA was on business education, specialising in tourism. His PhD research was undertaken at the Centre for Higher Education Studies and his thesis was on the subject of tourism, knowledge and the curriculum. He joined the Faculty of Leisure and Tourism, BCUC, as Senior Lecturer in 1993, became Principal Lecturer in 1997 and was appointed Professor of Tourism and Head of Research in 2000. He is also Visiting Lecturer at the University of Surrey.

John has spent his career in education in both the USA and the

xiv Contributors

United Kingdom. His teaching has focused on economics, strategy and education aspects of leisure and tourism, and he has authored two text-books in these areas, one of which is translated into Spanish. His research interests are focused on education and sustainability issues. He has published widely in these two areas in books and journal articles and has accepted invitations to give conference papers across Europe. He has directed two major European research projects: TOURFOR (Sustainable Tourism in Forests) and THEME (Tourism Curriculum Development in Moldova). He also writes occasional articles for *The Times* and the *Guardian* newspapers. John's professional interests include leisure and tourism economics; leisure and tourism strategy; higher education in leisure and tourism; and sustainability in leisure and tourism.

Foreword

This is a compelling book, to be read and thoughtfully considered by every serious researcher involved in tourism at the planning and management level.

The linguist Wick Miller once observed that no one has ever written an ethnography of academia – their goals, their methods and their behaviours. This unique volume might be the catalyst to prompt such a study. Dating to Aristotle, scholars in every discipline have diligently sought 'the truth' but their philosophies and products have varied according to the dictates of the individual field of study.

The global importance of tourism has generated the need for answers to problems such as economic development, social impact, stakeholder conflicts, environmental degradation and political control. These questions all seek 'the truth' but the orientation is different. The business world wants to know 'who, what, when and where' for that is their 'bottom line'. Their approach is essentially quantitative, and statistically oriented for forecasting. By contrast, researchers involved in heritage, habitat and history quest for 'why': what roles did or do these elements play in human society and its survival? To what degree have they changed, and how should they be interpreted now? What is appropriate authenticity?

As the editors point out, a resurgent interest in the qualitative methodology as it applies to the study of tourism surfaced a little over a decade ago but lacked a substantive base. Here, in this first-of-a-kind compendium, a body of recognised scholars have outlined diverse research techniques and illustrated them with case studies. Culture, as a set of human survival customs, may be a collective noun but the behaviours of individuals operating within their respective ethnic bonds can seldom be ranked on a scale of 1 to 10.

The phenomenal growth of tourism in the past five decades has dramatically changed global lifestyles to include tourism, and the impetus for still greater growth is rooted in globalisation and the expanding economies of Asia. We in the West have much to learn about these future 'new' tourists who will have discretionary income, leisure time, and even government

xvi Foreword

sanctions (as a balance of trade factor) to visit Europe and the Americas in the next decade.

The great merits of this book are its new paths for studying tourism as a societal institution, as we once learned to study the family, the factory and world view as cultural components of a survival system. The case studies open wide opportunities for testing and theoretical validation. This is a *must read*.

Valene L. Smith Chico, California

Acknowledgements

Some three years ago we decided that a book about qualitative research in tourism would make a useful contribution to the field as we had both had to rely heavily on qualitative methodology books from outside tourism when developing ideas for our PhDs. We put together a tentative proposal and sent it to Routledge for their consideration. Since that time the scope of the project has widened considerably. With the encouragement of Routledge and anonymous reviewers we approached a number of established tourism researchers around the world and asked them to make specific contributions exploring key social science research concepts in relation to the study of tourism. We are grateful for the enthusiasm with which the majority of them accepted the challenge offered them.

The successful completion of this project and its metamorphosis from an edited book of accounts of qualitative tourism research in the United Kingdom, to a collection of contributions considering the theoretical underpinnings of qualitative tourism research and how the theory is applied in practice in the field, is in no small part due to the efforts of a range of individuals. First and foremost, our contributors, to whom thanks are due for their thought-provoking contributions and passion for the project. Second to Routledge for being prepared to take on such a ground-breaking project and take a risk on two relatively unknown writers. Third to the reviewers, with whom we have not always agreed but who have provided us with extremely useful guidance on turning what was originally a disparate collection of papers to what we now hope is a coherent book. Finally, thanks are due to friends, family and colleagues, who have given us encouragement and support throughout the whole process.